

ՀԱՆԴԷՍ ԱՄՍՕՐԵԱՅ - HANDES AMSORYA - 2018



Հրատարակուել է
Գալուստ Կիլպենկեան հիմնարկութեան
հովանաւորութեամբ

ՀԱՆԴԷՍ ԱՄՍՕՐԵԱՅ

ՀԱՅԱԳԻՏԱԿԱՆ ՈՒՍՈՒՄՆԱԹԵՐԹ

ԹԻԻ 1-12

ՅՈՒՆՈՒԱՐ - ԴԵԿՏԵՄԲԵՐ

ՃԼԲ. ՏԱՐԻ 2018

The First Two Discourses of the Yačaxapatum as a Single Discourse on the Most Holy Trinity

Abraham Terian

That “Discourse 2” constitutes the continuation of “Discourse 1”, disrupted in the course of the textual transmission of the monastic document known as *Yačaxapatum Čark’* (*Յաճախապատում ճարք*, literally, *Oft-repeated Discourses*), is based on two observations. First, the opening paragraph of Disc. 2 (§§1-6) appears as an integral part of Disc. 1 in the earliest florilegium of credal extracts known as *Knik’ Hawatoy* (*Կնիք Հաւատոյ, Seal of Faith*). The latter was compiled probably by Yovhan(nēs) Mayravaneč’i or Mayragomec’i “in the days of Catholicos Komitas” (in office 611/15-628).¹ Second, Disc. 2, like all the rest of the discourses, ends with a formulaic Trinitarian invocation with the concluding “Amen,” a feature not found at the conclusion of Disc. 1 as we have it. Obviously, the non-formulaic Trinitarian statement at the

end of Disc. 1 (§25) was mistaken for such a conclusion by an early scribe, whose manuscript became the archetype of subsequent copies of the document, all of which divide the discourse into two at this point.

In the manuscripts as well as in the published editions, the inappropriate, secondary title given to Disc. 2, “On the Distinct Persons of the Holy Trinity” (*«Ի Սուրբ Երրորդութեանն Առանձնաւորութիւնն»*, “*I Surb Errordut’iann Aranjnaworut’iwnsn*”) is based on the Trinitarian affirmation found at the beginning of Disc. 1 (§§1-6). The severed Disc. 2, however, is mostly on the Creator’s beneficence,² underscoring the providential care offered by the Holy Trinity for the benefit of all creation.

¹ Karapet Tēr-Mkertč’ian, ed. (Ējmiacin: Mother See Press, 1914; repr. Antelias: The Armenian Catholicosate of Cilicia, 1998; Leuven: Peeters, 1974, under the title *Le Sceau de la Foi*), pp. 18-22; cf. *Matenagirk’ Hayoc’* (*Մատենագիրք Հայոց*) 4:59-62.

² Cf. the title of Disc. 10: “On the Beneficence of the Generously Benevolent Will (of God) and Admonition unto Goodness and Beyond, in Accordance with True Virtue Practiced to the Glory of the Most Holy Trinity” (*«Երախտատրութիւն անգեղ բարեբար կամացն եւ յորդորումն ի յամն եւ յառանգն ըստ ճշմարիտ առաքինութեանն ի փառս Ամենասուրբ Երրորդութեանն»*).

As for the text translated here, it is that of the 2nd Venice edition (1954, first published in 1838), adopted by the editors of the text in volume I of the *Matenagirk' Hayoc'* series, with section divisions added to the text.³ These I have followed for convenience, albeit with a degree of reluctance because of improper punctuation at times. This text predates that of the 1894 Ējmiacin edition, which is uncritically based on manuscripts of an abortive attempt in the early Cilician Period to improve the poor composition of the original text already excerpted and codified in the *Knik' Hawatoy*, where its antiquity is firmly established. Curiously enough, this effort to rewrite — with slight amplification — the poorly composed original text tapers off after Disc. 2 (titled “Afanjavorut'iwnk” («Առանձնաւորութիւնք», the singular of which usually translates Gk. ὕπόστασις or Lat. *Personalitas*,⁴ a likely abbreviation of the fuller title mentioned above).

Whether consisting of 23 discourses or 22 — when considering the first two discourses as one, the *Yačaxapatum* collection as we have it is an anonymous work dating from the latter part of the 6th century. This date is based (1) on the fact that the document shows reliance on the Armenian translation of St. Basil's *Rules* (Ճգնողականաց կրաւնաւորաց, *Ġgnotakanac' krawnaworac'*), which was accomplished at the turn of the 6th century,⁵

and (2) on the earliest utilization of the document, in the *Knik' Hawatoy* at the turn of the 7th century. Furthermore, the discourses are intended for a monastic community, to abide by the biblically based moral admonitions of the author who writes authoritatively as an abbot.

When considering the history of scholarship on the document, I find the comments made by (Fr.) Kiwregh K'iparian on its authorship and date thoroughly compelling: that neither of the traditional attributions — whether to St. Gregory the Illuminator as the author of a Greek original or to St. Maštoc' as its translator or author — is tenable.⁶ My own study substantiates all the points made by K'iparian, concluding with him that the document postdates the Golden Age of Armenian literature. Further observations on authorship and date, as well as on the poor composition of the document, are detailed in the introduction to my comprehensive study of the document, to appear with an annotated translation of the discourses.

Discourse 1: On the Most Holy Trinity

¹The nature and being of the Most Holy Trinity are one, and of the selfsame

the data obtained from the work, both internal and external, seems to narrow down its translation into Armenian most probably to between the end of the fifth century and the beginning of the sixth century.” (“La convergenza di tutti questi dati, esterni ed interni all'opera, sembra circoscrivere tra la fine del V sec. e l'inizio del VI l'epoca più probabile della sua traduzione in armeno”) (p. ix).

⁶ «Յանձխապատմ' ճաներու ղեղինակի Բարդը» (“The Question of the *Yačaxapatum*' Discourses' Authorship), *Բազմալեզու* 120 (1962) 237-42; written as a response to A. N. Srapyan's unsustainable views on authorship and date (attributed to Maštoc', early 5th century), under the same title: «Յանձխապատմ' ճաների ղեղինակի Բարդը», *Տեղեկագիր* (ապրիլ 1, 1962/5) 25-38.

essence — not from another being. ²The Father who is without beginning possesses the causation of the Son and the Spirit. ³He is unbegotten entity and existence without beginning, boundless eternity and immutable truth, the life and sustainer of all living beings. ⁴He is the Father of the Son and the Source of the Spirit.⁷ He is God and Creator of creatures, seen and unseen. ⁵He is said to be the Cause of the Son through birth and the Source of the Holy Spirit. ⁶He himself is the unbegotten Existent, begetting the One who is without beginning; begetting the immutable Truth of the boundlessly eternal; begetting the Giver of life, the Life that bestows life; begetting the living Light, the Light of living beings; begetting the Benefactor of goodness; the Creator begetting the Creator of all creatures, seen and unseen,⁸ ⁷the Founder of heaven and of the heavenly powers, of earth and the creatures therein. ⁸He is replete (with everything) and perfect, and “accomplishes all in all” (Eph 1:23). He is not wanting; who is neither renewed nor aging; who is neither replenished nor consumed; who is always the same in his fullness and unboundedness. ⁹And into his unlimited and unattainable and boundless and most perfect nature there is neither infiltration nor addition. ¹⁰The mind cannot attain him, nor could angels comprehend him, even though they are of the same hue as the human mind. Rather, the heavenly and earthly beings assume their service wherever the Creator's will assigns them. ¹¹Just as heaven and all its adornments are established by God's Word and Spirit,⁹

so is earth, with its mountains and plains, seas and rivers, and dense forests.

¹²And there is no other Creator but the Holy Trinity, the almighty Lordship, the clear, plain, and all-capable Power, “who spoke and they came to be; commanded and they stood firm” (Ps 33:9 [32:9 LXX]); ¹³who sits in the heaven of heavens and cares for all creatures; who in his foreknowledge and infinite wisdom manages all the heavenly and earthly beings. And he is the life and sustainer of all; unlimited, unreachable, and unfathomable in all things. ¹⁴He is love,¹⁰ full of vital blessings; unapproachable light,¹¹ awe-inspiring and wonderful. ¹⁵Knowledge and wisdom are ascertained through him; he lives and is life-giving, merciful and benevolent in grace, long-suffering and sustainer. ¹⁶He is the Most Holy to those who approach him in holiness and righteousness, constant Enlightener of those rational by nature. And he is the Truth in all things: in rebuking and exhorting sinners that they may survive the wrath that will befall the wicked. ¹⁷Moreover, he exhorts with promises of good things, that we may become worthy of gaining the eternal crowns of glory. ¹⁸For he is a comforting harbor to those who persevere patiently under the care of his sacred love; he graces with ineffable blessings those who are virtuous in spirit. ¹⁹His greatness is inscrutable; the Existent without beginning is beyond comprehension, being unlimited and unbounded. Through his overseeing care he satisfies all creatures. ²⁰He knows the thoughts of the heart and searches the innermost parts,¹² and leads through the law of the life-giving and immortal Spirit to the remarkable joy, the endless rejoicing, the

⁷ Cf. §§5, 23; Disc. 5.3; 6.1, 23.

⁸ The Son's traditional epithets and role in creation are stated in mostly Johannine terms in this section; cf. Disc. 3.4, with reference to the Trinity.

⁹ Allusion to Ps 33:6 (32:6 LXX).

¹⁰ Allusion to 1 John 4:8, 16.

¹¹ Allusion to 1 Tim 6:16; cf. Ps 104:2 (103:2 LXX).

¹² Allusion to Ps 139:23 (138:23 LXX).

³ *Matenagirk' Hayoc'* 1:7-137.

⁴ ՆԲՀԼ (NBHL) 1:286, short for «Երիս Առանձնաւորութիւնս, Աստուածութիւն Մի» (“*Eris Afanjavorut'iwns, Astuacut'iwn Mi*” / “*Essentiae Dei Unitate in Trinitate Personarum*”).

⁵ For the Armenian version of Basil's *Asceticon* or the *Quaestiones* (the so-called “rules”), see Gabriella Uluhogian, ed. and trans., *Basilio di Cesarea: Il libro delle domande (Le Regole)*, CSCO 536-537, *Scriptores Armeniaci* t. 19-20 (Lovanii: Peeters, 1993). In her second volume, Uluhogian concludes: “The convergence of all

ineffable and untold goodness (that comes) by inheriting the Kingdom of God.

²¹Now, all these self-generating acts of the unboundedly eternal One, done by virtue of his benevolence, are for the well-being of his creatures; for he, the infinite and inscrutable One, is their sustainer through his care. ²²Those incapable of comprehending the Father, the Son, and the Holy Spirit because of their own lack of spiritual wisdom, should know and recognize the almighty Lordship of the One Godhead through his works and beneficence.¹³ ²³For as sunshine and light and warmth are attributable to one sun and no other, and as fountain and water and river are said to be of one nature, as also mind, reason, and spirit¹⁴ are understood in man, so (one may) also understand here the one nature and Godhead of the Father, Son, and Holy Spirit.¹⁵ ²⁴For the sun is not without light and warmth, and a fountain is not without water and source, and the mind is not without reason and spirit. ²⁵Likewise, the Father is neither without the Son nor without the Holy Spirit.

(Discourse 2: On the Distinct Persons of the Holy Trinity)

¹The Father is perfect in personhood and power, knowledge and wisdom, creation and benevolence, and possesses within himself the unbegotten entity. ²The Son is perfect in personhood and power, knowledge and wisdom, creation and benevolence, who also possesses within himself the existence without be-

ginning. ³The Holy Spirit is perfect in personhood and power, knowledge and wisdom, creation and benevolence, and possesses within himself the utmost existence without beginning. ⁴One is the nature of the Godhead and of the immutable Entity. One creation and one benevolence, one Lordship and one Power; and there is neither shortage nor excess of glory in the Trinity without beginning. ⁵For he is the fountain of every goodness, and by him all the gifts of creation are distributed among all creatures. ⁶He makes, sustains, and nurtures by his benevolence those seen and unseen; and those who believe in him and persevere in holiness, in the fear of God and "with a pure heart and a sincere faith," as written (1 Tim 1:5), he leads by the Spirit and right doctrine towards his Kingdom and glory.¹⁶

¹⁶ The appropriation of the Trinitarian theology of the Cappadocian Fathers is obvious throughout. Gregory of Nazianzus (329-390), "the Theologian," is the foremost teacher on the Holy Trinity in Eastern Christian tradition. For his profound theology on the subject, see Christopher A. Beeley, *Gregory of Nazianzus on the Trinity and the Knowledge of God: In Your Light We Shall See Light*, Oxford Studies in Historical Theology (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2008). On his influence on the Armenian Church, see Kim Muradyan, *Գրիգոր Նազիանզիի հայ մատենագրության մեջ (Grigor Nazianzac'in hay matenagrut'yan meĵ)*, Gregory of Nazianzus in Armenian Writings (Erevan: Haykakan SSH GA Hratarak'ut'yun, 1983). Cf. the dialogues *On the Holy Trinity* by Theodoret of Cyrillus (wrongly ascribed to Cyril of Alexandria, PG 75:1147-1189) and those by pseudo-Athanasius (PG 28:1115-1286), contemporaries of "the Theologian". On the Armenian version of the latter's "Fourth Dialogue" see Alessandro Capone, ed. and trans., *Pseudo-Atanasio: Dialoghi IV e V sulla santa Trinità: testo greco con traduzione italiana, versione latina e armena*, CSCO 634 / CSCO Subsidia 125 (Leuven: Peeters, 2011), pp. 49-61; cf. Robert W. Thomson, "The Transformation of Athanasius in Armenian Theology," *Le Muséon* 78 (1965) 47-69.

¹³ A rudimentary form of mystical understanding of God, who remains inscrutable; cf. §§10, 19. An echo of Rom 1:18-19 is discernible here.

¹⁴ The latter triad draws on the synonymy of these terms, a *topos* in classical philosophy and the anthropological theology of the Fathers.

¹⁵ The same analogy is found in Disc. 6.3.

⁷Thus we have received the word of faith and thus you believed¹⁷ in the Most Holy Trinity: in God who creates, in the Lord who establishes, and in the Grace that gives life;¹⁸ ⁸who by his life-giving light and sacred love prepares heirs of his ineffable Kingdom, and prompts recollection of the promised, ineffable gifts that are kept in store for those who trust in him in faith and love. ⁹For the love of creation compelled the Creator to make all creatures, seen and unseen. He did not make them for the needs of the Deity but "for his glory to be revealed, to be understood through the things that are made visible" (Rom 1:20) to incorporeal and corporeal beings.¹⁹ ¹⁰Not as if receiving anything from living beings but rather giving them life; not (just) the light for the eyes but that they be enlightened by his light in order to behold him. Thus the Lord gives life to his creatures, and enlightens them, those intelligent and rational beings, and distributes spiritual gifts to them as he wills. ¹¹"Though there are categories of gifts... but the same God who facilitates them all in everyone" (1 Cor 12:4-6). ¹²And he bestowed honor upon angels and humans, the princely will, so that they may glorify God who is benevolent, who brought about existence out of no existence and through the Holy Scriptures taught the principles of piety so that they may flee from evil and embrace the good, and to be renewed from glory to glory.

¹³God's love is revealed to us in this: it was for our sake that he made the heavens and the earth and the created

¹⁷ Echoing 1 Cor 15:11.

¹⁸ Grace as metonym for the Spirit is a *hapax* in these discourses. The form is reminiscent of later formulae, e.g., "The Father is the Creator; the Son, the Redeemer; the Holy Spirit, the Sanctifier"; cf. Disc. 6.7; 12.37.

¹⁹ Cf. Disc. 11.14.

things therein, and through such care he continues to reveal his benevolent love. ¹⁴For this reason, created beings should draw near to God with true love, with faith and hope,²⁰ and with obedience to his commandments; and he will reward them. ¹⁵I always say: In all things let us be grateful for his benevolent care, and become confessors, professing the truth, and remain obedient to his ordinances, which pleases the Lord — (our) abiding in love towards God in times of both trouble and calm. ¹⁶And let us not call created things by the Creator's name,²¹ nor twist the truth into lies. ¹⁷Rather, let us be receptive to the beneficence of his spotless, immaculately pure love. ¹⁸The Creator has set all these just and righteous rules perpetually for his creatures.

¹⁹For this reason, let us cease from vain and pointless criticism and let us follow the counsel of the Holy Scriptures, both Old and New. ²⁰And let no one be left out of saying what is right: "For in him we live and move and have our being" (Acts 17:28). ²¹Listen to him and trust in him, the One who saved us from all dangers and who transfers us to the Kingdom of Heaven. ²²He, who calls everyone unto obedience to the spiritual law, says in the Psalter: "Come, my children, listen to me, and I will teach you the fear of the Lord" (Ps 34:11 [33:12 LXX]). ²³As the Lord says: "He who keeps my commandments is the one who loves me; and he who loves me, my Father will love him, and we will come to him and make our home with him" (John 14:21, 23). ²⁴We have been honored with such ineffable love!

²⁰ Echoing 1 Cor 13:13, quoted in §48.

²¹ Pointing to the veneration of idols and/or animals, as in ancient Egypt; cf. Rom 1:25. Note the use of the word *ararack'* in several senses: from created things or beings to creatures in general and humans in particular.

²⁵Now, let no one be found "hostile to God" (Rom 8:7), lest we forfeit the blessed life which he promised to the saints. ²⁶For the righteous shall inherit the good things, and sinners shall bear punishment. ²⁷"Those who live in accordance with the Spirit of God," (Scripture) says, "they are the children of God; and those who persist in the flesh, cannot please God" (Rom 8:13-14, 8). ²⁸For by living such a spiritual life we shall enjoy the whole goodness of heaven. ²⁹The breadth and span of that eternal life is beyond measure, unlike (anything). That which the Creator has prepared because of his love, through the Holy Spirit, is beyond description. That which God shall give to those who love him is beyond what could be heard or understood. Because of his life-giving love, they shall enjoy these good things that are over and above any thought or understanding, even past the heavenly hosts. He shall make them rest among the ranks of the immortal. ³⁰There, the elect will be in mansions,²² in unfathomable joy, as they are worthy.

³¹As rational souls, they are living and immortal, and have no limit to the extent or distance of their mobility — whether they ascend above heaven or descend into the sea — by virtue of their remarkable wisdom and knowledge that comes first from the Holy Scriptures. In the twinkling of an eye they are gathered into the state of a living body.²³ Likewise our bodies will be transformed into that unfathomable and ineffable life, into radiant beams and living light and unto glory at the resurrection time; they will be absorbed by the Spirit's fire into that light which does not go out.²⁴ ³²Our physical sight is so dim and pathetic when

22 Allusion to John 14:2.

23 Echoing 1 Cor 15:52.

24 Echoing Matt 13:43.

compared to that of the immortal souls. Every bit of light or even the brightest beam will vanish for us creatures;²⁵ it cannot be compared, it passes away. Whereas the living beams of the glory of the Sun of Righteousness, with which the saints will be clothed in eternal life,²⁶ do not pass away. The sun's light, with which we — of ordinary soul and body — clothe ourselves and are satisfied, seeing it from east to west, is a vanishing light according to the word of the Lord: "The sun and the moon will be darkened... and the stars will be covered," he says, "and the righteous will shine like the sun in the Kingdom of God" (Matt 24:29; 13:43). ³³"For when Christ, your life, appears," says the Apostle, "then you also will appear with him in glory" (Col 3:4). We will be absorbed by the Divine fire into that light which does not go out and which is holy. ³⁴And when he clothes us with his inextinguishable light, the light of the Sun of Righteousness, which befits the happy countenance of the saints, it will quicken and illumine us continuously. ³⁵Of those blessed with the good news of his sacred love, who are altogether glorified with the fullness of Christ and more,²⁷ none could refrain oneself from saying: "God will be all in all" (1 Cor 15:28). ³⁶Such a one is filled with the eternal good, according to the word of the Lord, as he asked of the Father: "As you and I are one, may the believers and the saints also be in us" (John 17:21). ³⁷For God so loved humanity that he bestowed upon us the honor and glory of the Divinity.²⁸ ³⁸God made this world for humans: to beget, to be sustained, and to live just-

25 Allusion to Matt 24:29 (cf. Mark 13:24).

26 Cf. Disc. 12.41.

27 Allusion to Eph 4:13.

28 Echoing Ps 8:5-6 (8:6-7 LXX); cf. 82:6 (81:6 LXX); See §140 and note.

ly, righteously, and virtuously. He bestowed upon it his delightful and divine grace, like a decree, ever-renewing its eternal blessings and endless joys.

³⁹This, which we have discussed, is only a fraction of the plenitude of goodness. ⁴⁰Just as infants in their mothers' womb are unaware of how they are about to grow and see God's creation and enjoy it, so we are unable to comprehend. ⁴¹This is in keeping with the word of the Apostle, which says: "For we know in part and we prophesy in part, but when perfection comes, the imperfect disappears" (1 Cor 13:9-10). ⁴²This (goodness) is more than the plenitude of things and is ineffable, incomprehensible even to incorporeal beings — certainly inexpressible for the grasp of the mind of corporeal beings. ⁴³For just as darkness flees away from light, earthlings (shy away) from heavenly and immortal beings. ⁴⁴To attain this goodness every positive effort should be made on our part, to continue in the husbandry that pleases God, that culminates in (receiving) the promised good things.²⁹ ⁴⁵Let us flee from the filthy and abominable passions³⁰ and the evils that threaten with painful consequences, and let us follow with clean lives the example of those above. ⁴⁶To be beneficent, with love towards brothers, for their necessities of life;³¹ to cultivate the good traditions for the redemption of our souls and bodies, for we have been invited and called unto the

29 Remotely alluding to Matt 25:21 ("Well done, ..."), an often quoted verse (see Disc. 4.78; 5.122; 6.83; 11.95; 18.59; 23.79).

30 The term "passion" (Arm. ցանկություն [c'anku-t'iwn]) throughout, as in the Byzantine monastic tradition, is used as the equivalent of vice.

31 Fraternal love and care, including correction, is a traditional monastic requirement for the good of others; see Disc. 5.106, 6.72, 96; 11.33; 23.32, 44, 57, 71, 86.

grace of adoption.³² ⁴⁷For goodness has been planted in us by God, even the sovereign will, so that we may always do willfully what is good. ⁴⁸For the spiritual law has been established in our hearts: "hope, love, and faith" (1 Cor 13:13), along with that sovereign angelic and human will, ⁴⁹so that we may become heirs of the glorious life and be honored by the Creator with the inexpressible blessings.³³

⁵⁰And to creatures with sovereign mind he appointed two tutors, as for one's child: threats and promises of good things;³⁴ to fear the threats and run away from harms, and to desire the promised good things and follow righteousness;⁵¹ to obey — following the right counsel of the Holy Scriptures — the authorities that administer justice for the sake of the (common) good.³⁵ ⁵²For this reason he gave us the Prophets and the Apostles, (also) patriarchs, vardapets,³⁶ and teachers, to make us aware of and knowledgeable and well-informed about God's good will, so that whoever chooses may come to the knowledge of truth and live,³⁷ and through their righteous deeds show gratitude to the heavenly Father and to the only-begotten Son and to the Holy Spirit, who grants life to his creatures to collaborate with God's good will. ⁵³He shall bring those who truly and righteously

32 Allusion to Eph 1:5-6; cf. Rom 8:14-17, 23; Gal 4:1-7. In §§129 and 133, as elsewhere, adoption is linked to baptism (Disc. 3.17; 9.29-30; to baptism and the Eucharist in 5.45; 9.23; 13.31-35; 14.17). See also Disc. 3.16; 6.17; 9.30; 10.48, 88 (on adoption as grace); for more, see the Subject Index.

33 Allusion to the "Beatitudes" in Matt 5:1-16.

34 Cf. Disc. 18.3.

35 Allusion to Rom 13:1-5; cf. Titus 3:1; 1 Pet 2:13-14.

36 Arm. word for ecclesiastical teacher; later, doctor of divinity; here used redundantly with the synonymous word *usuc'ic's* ("teachers").

37 Allusion to 1 Tim 2:4.

abide by these (mandates) into his divine inheritance, as the Apostle says: "Heirs of God and co-heirs with Christ... ⁵⁴if we become like Christ [we may] also share in his glory" (Rom 8:17). ⁵⁵Therefore let us not be sluggish in our lives, but let us give heed to our calling, with an earnest haste to learn and do his will, "so that one may be called great in the Kingdom of God" (Matt 5:19).

⁵⁶We, whom he created and instructed, the elect of his Lordship, were taught that by observing the ways of our Savior we may become like him.³⁸ ⁵⁷Thus, through the prophetic word, the apostolic preaching, and the patriarchates,³⁹ we have come to recognize the Father almighty, the Son equal in power, and the Holy Spirit their co-worker. ⁵⁸And by the right faith⁴⁰ we have come to recognize and to know the Creator and to persevere in what pleases him; to remain inseparably bound to his love in both dire and tranquil times; and (in doing so) we shall be justified according to the Benefactor's will. ⁵⁹To bear unfailing witness to God, to cordially bless the Lord, the giver of all good things, and to praise him with thanksgiving. ⁶⁰And the Lord himself

³⁸ Possible allusion to Eph 5:1, quoted below, §127; cf. 1 John 3:2.

³⁹ The pl. *hayrapetut'eambk'n* most likely refers to the four ancient patriarchates of Orthodoxy: Constantinople, Alexandria, Antioch, and Jerusalem.

⁴⁰ Arm. *ողղափստ հաստոյ* (*ullap'ar hawatoy*), suggestive of orthodoxy, is used four times (§§58, 143 and Disc. 5.26; 23.58; cf. *ողղափստստոյիմ* [*ullahawatut'iwn*], Disc. 5.97). The simpler form, *ուիի հաստոյ* (*uhit hawatov*), with the same meaning of "right faith," is used seven times (Disc. 3.4; 5.34; 6.98; 13.31; 15.62; 18.58; and 20.156). The adj. *ullap'ar* is used likewise, in the sense of "orthodox," with reference to teachers (§120; cf. *uhit* in Disc. 12.6), confession of faith (§138; cf. *ուիի հանգամանաց* [*uhit hangamanac*], with reference to its fundamentals, in Disc. 20.125), and episcopal synods or councils (Disc. 23.58).

holds his beneficence as proof of his love and benevolence towards his chosen and perfect ones, in whom God's grace overflows. ⁶¹He mercifully pardons, cares for, and heals those who repent and with confession turn to his beneficence; and he forgives their sins according to his immense compassion. ⁶²He is longsuffering towards the wicked and the unjust, the arrogant exceeding in vice, whose minds are in darkness and who are estranged from holy and righteous living, that they may have remorse. ⁶³Otherwise, "the Creator's wrath and fury will remain upon them all," according to the saying of the Apostle (Rom 1:18).

⁶⁴Such are the issues of life for the Giver of Life and for the recipient; he cares for his visible and invisible creatures daily through his sustaining love. ⁶⁵And he directs his benevolence to nurture and sustain — through the diverse gifts of his knowledge and wisdom, which compel the attentive and diligent to guard his commandments. ⁶⁶And by his power he enables them and keeps them steadfast; for, being strengthened, they withstand the machinations of Satan; and they remain unmoved and steadfast in their love for the truth. They are stimulated in the excellent virtues and essential works that crown with glory. ⁶⁷Such are those who revel in good things. ⁶⁸For they pursue their convictions with true faith and hope, for the sake of the blessings of the life-giving good news, lovingly cherishing the life to come, which is beyond measure and scrutiny. For they shall enjoy his blessings with him, and shall dwell with him in his ineffable joy. ⁶⁹For in his great mercy he compassionately cares for their spiritual and physical needs. ⁷⁰Being strengthened in grace and with God-given gifts, they revel in good health and peace.

⁷¹And because of the renewal by the longsuffering goodness of God, one is able to confront the visible and invisible (evils); and being cleansed from filth by a holy God, the person is freed and enlightened about the glory of the redeeming Lordship and remains untouched by the enemy. And he stays pure and impeccable, immune from deadly sins, being enlightened about the hope of the resurrection. ⁷²And he is uplifted by the glory of humility, by which arrogance is vanquished, by honoring the Lord. ⁷³For the humble, the obedient, and the meek shall be uplifted, but the arrogant, the oppressive, and the faithless shall be vanquished before the fear of the Lord. ⁷⁴And the just shall be crowned and glorified in every way by the Creator in the Kingdom of the righteous. ⁷⁵For every utterance of the good news is an invitation to believers, those who are good and virtuous, to (enter) the gates of righteousness, to enjoy the honors and crowns of glory from him. ⁷⁶For because of his mercy, compassion, and caring, those who truly repent shall receive forgiveness from his almighty Lordship.

⁷⁷But terrifying words of chastisement summon the wicked—the prodigals, those who love the passions, the disobedient, and those who persist in sin—to eternal torments and perpetual death and hell. ⁷⁸For they disdained the Creator's compassion and care and strayed far from true repentance that would have cleansed, justified, and drawn them closer to eternal life. ⁷⁹They will therefore receive shame and "the unquenchable fire which is prepared for Satan and his demons" (Matt 25:41).

⁸⁰All these are ordained for our needs and concerns by the benevolent will of God. ⁸¹To those on the sanctified and good side, the promised good things

from the Lord; ⁸²but to those on the evil and disobedient side, the chastisement with wrath and fury that they will receive, the vengeance at the hand of the angel of evil.⁴¹ ⁸³For had they been willing, they could have avoided the tangible wrath and had it removed through genuine repentance, according to the great mercy of the Creator. ⁸⁴And he deals with such promises of blessings and chastisement in order to correct, so that all would be willing, that they might have life and reach the Kingdom; ⁸⁵also to reveal those who are the elect among us, who conduct their lives by his righteous laws. ⁸⁶For the one who is good by nature and truly so, will remain always good, lacking nothing in absolute goodness.

⁸⁷These things that are called God's fury, wrath, or (chastening) threats, are said to be the justice of his law, since the unjust and the senseless are corrected with (such) threats bursting with wrath. ⁸⁸Surely, there is no blemish or stain in the One who is perfect in benevolence and kindness. Neither does evil emanate from him nor is there any tinge of it in him; he is in essence good and not a trace of vice is to be found in him. ⁸⁹For it is our sins that annoy God, and he admonishes us with punishments, though mindful of mercy in his wrath. For those who are admonished are being visited by the Creator. ⁹⁰For it behooves us to abhor sin and love justice, holiness, and truth, which make the Creator happy along with his hosts.

⁹¹These are demonstrations of his love, for he rejoices over the conduct and morals of men who repent of their evil

⁴¹ Here and in the next paragraph, as in Disc. 17.32, the author endeavors to absolve God from any evil, even inflicting punishment; an argument of theodicy. Cf. Basil's *Quod Deus non est auctor malorum* (Hom. 9).

lives. ⁹²For he is life and sustainer of life, and love brimming with gifts. No one could accurately describe his all-powerful greatness: none of the countless powerful heavenly hosts or anyone from among humans, from whom he is pleased to receive blessing and worship with prostration. ⁹³All the blasphemy by demons, the heathen, the wicked, and sinners does not have the slightest effect on the untouchable light of the Godhead. ⁹⁴All the armies of myriads of angels, who persist in ceaseless praise, and those chosen by the Lord from among humans, are incapable of blessing God worthily. ⁹⁵For the Godhead is neither honored nor dishonored by anyone; nothing of his glory is changed by that, for he is Life and immutable Light that does not pass away.

⁹⁶What is amazing is that he who is Nameless has acquired a name because of his utmost love; for there was nobody with the One without beginning to call him by name. ⁴² Yet his creatures call him Creator because of his benevolence and benevolent will. ⁹⁷It is because of his care for creatures that he is called Creator and Benefactor and Light and Life. As to his name, he alone knows it. ⁹⁸For he is the inextinguishable Light of Light, Life of the Living, Immaterial Fire, and Creator of the material fire. ⁴³ ⁹⁹For as he was, he is, and remains so forever. He alone is omniscient. He revealed himself to his creatures because of his love, and made himself known through his care.

42 An indicator of *apophatic* theology, which is slow to identify God with any human concept capable of defining him.

43 The first of these epithets recalls one of the Nicene Creed; others echo biblical ascriptions to God as "consuming fire" (e.g., Exod 24:17; Deut 4:24; Heb 12:29; cf. Exod 3:1-6, on Moses and "the burning bush") more than echoing Greek mythology surrounding the fire-god Hephaistos and/or Prometheus.

¹⁰⁰And he called his creatures, all sorts of people, to the discipleship of his benevolence: "First apostles," as Paul says, "then prophets, then teachers," and others that follow (1 Cor 12:28), ¹⁰¹those to whom the Holy Spirit distributes gifts according to their calling — those whom he has invited to his Kingdom. ¹⁰²He revealed the watchfulness of his love so that we may be justified in believing it, whereby we shall enter into Christ our God's glorious inheritance. ¹⁰³For he has called those who believe his "vineyard"; and the heavenly Father, the "Gardener," ⁴⁴ by whom the disciples — the "gardeners" — are sanctified and gathered into the eternal storerooms: ¹⁰⁴those who labored from the first hour to the last, those willing (late-comers) who were rewarded by the (All)-knowing as much as those who were (hired) first. ⁴⁵ ¹⁰⁵But those who alienated themselves from the love of God, "who makes the sun shine upon the wicked and the good" (Matt 5:45), and estranged themselves, cannot be rewarded like the children of God — ¹⁰⁶all those saints who pursued righteousness and spiritual husbandry, who through preaching the truth attained the promised good things that are in Christ Jesus, to the glory of the Most Holy Trinity, ¹⁰⁷and who filled the universe with the Word of Life ⁴⁶ and renewed believers with water and Spirit. ⁴⁷ ¹⁰⁸Moreover, they preached salvation by the grace of the Son of God, through confession and repentance.

¹⁰⁹For by nature he is the Father of his only-begotten Son, and Life of Life, Light of Light, and the Good of Goodness.

44 Reference to John 15:1.

45 Reference to "The Parable of the Workers in the Vineyard," Matt 20:1-16; cf. Disc. 11.118.

46 Echoing 1 John 1:1.

47 Echoing John 1:33.

¹¹⁰And by grace he is called our Father also; and Light, who enlightens us through the faith; and Life, who works life in us. ¹¹¹He reveals himself to people through true manifestations: to some through nature ⁴⁸ and to others through providential care, (like) a father to orphans. ⁴⁹ ¹¹²He thus draws us near; moreover, to imitate his creative, providential care; to turn the misguided to the knowledge of God, by the grace of the benevolent Father; ¹¹³more so, regarding benevolence, to become like him in compassionate love. ⁵⁰ ¹¹⁴He teaches sinners so that they may not be lost eternally; rather, to proceed thoughtfully in the right path, (guided) by divine laws; to study, to learn, to attain wisdom and discipline, and to guide the lost with signs and wonders; ¹¹⁵to establish the disciples in the faith, to remain unmoved in the truth, to be very patient through all tribulations. ¹¹⁶Moreover, following the example of the Lord's love, to urge (others) to respond to his love, to care for and sustain (others) with compassion, to lift the burdens and aches of many, and to summon them to grace through repentance and the (baptismal) font. ¹¹⁷Also to fish tirelessly and skillfully, with the spiritual net, (to draw) many to piety; ⁵¹ ¹¹⁸to enlighten those in the darkness of sin and injustice; to cleanse, sanctify, and free (people) from servitude to Satan; to renew them in the renewal according to God: enlightenment, justice, and truth; and to (help them) take off the old self with its evil works, ⁵² so that they may be worthy of crowns and glory.

48 Echoing Rom 1:20.

49 Echoing John 14:18; Jas 1:27.

50 Echoing Luke 6:36.

51 Echoing Matt 4:19.

52 Allusion to Col 3:9; Eph 4:22.

¹¹⁹We have learned this line of work from the Father and from the Son and from the Holy Spirit, who always takes us as collaborators with his benevolent will, in accordance with the true traditions that keep the faithful people inerrant and close to the saints' resting places. ⁵³ ¹²⁰And thus we have been instructed: from opting for the Law to faith and light and love for justice, allegiance to the cumulative virtues and to the true Apostles and Prophets, to orthodox teachers and those who learned from them: witnesses, patient endurance of torture; confessors, perseverance; ascetic virgins, sanctity and virtue; penitents, forgiveness. ¹²¹For these reasons, God chose his people from humankind so that they may be zealous in good works, and obtain from his benevolence the imperishable crowns; ⁵⁴ ¹²²since they love the Creator and are loved by him, who by his grace did wondrous and remarkable things on earth and in heaven, and who abides forever.

¹²³For had there been no election by the Lord, in keeping with his righteous laws, the desirability and preciousness of the virtues would not have been (so) prominent. Moreover, the martyrs' example of the way to the blessed life, that of the saints whose lives were cut short (in their endeavor) to inherit the blessings, and that of the spiritual hosts who stayed in God's love ⁵⁵ would have been for naught.

53 Generally, Arm. ստիպանց սրբոց (*awt'evans srboc*) points to heavenly places, not to *martyria* (Arm. վկայարան, վկայանց [*vkayaran, vkayanoc*]). On the terminology for the latter, see Garsoian, *Epic Histories*, p. 543.

54 Echoing 1 Pet 5:4.

55 Allusion to the loyal angels of Rev 12:7-9. In verses 10-12, the revisited defeat and casting down of Satan (cf. Isa 14:12-15 on the king of Babylon; Ezek 28:1-19 on the king of Tyre; Luke 10:18 on Satan) as a result of Christ's triumphant death on the cross, are reaffirmed through the martyrs' testimony to the blood of

¹²⁴Those who strayed from the Creator's care shall be punished by the fearsome Judge, who shall recompense as deserved, for "the righteous shall go to eternal life, and the wicked to eternal punishment" (Matt 25:46). ¹²⁵The divine Word identifies both groups: "Come," he says, "you who are blessed by my Father; inherit the Kingdom of God" (Matt 25:34), and "Depart from me, you who are cursed, into the eternal fire prepared for Satan and his angels" (Matt 25:41). ¹²⁶He first admonishes and calls unto good works. "Come," he says, "to me, all you who are weary and burdened, and I will give you rest. Take my yoke upon you and learn meekness and humility from me, and you will find rest for your souls" (Matt 11:28-29). ¹²⁷And the Apostle says: "Be like God, as dearly loved children, and persevere in love, just as Christ loved us and gave himself up for us⁵⁶ as a sacrifice to God" (Eph 5:1-2).

¹²⁸For the Son of God made humans his heirs, and lavishly bestowed upon us the grace of the Holy Spirit. ¹²⁹For with kind entreaties he called sinners to repent through confession and to obey the Gospel of Life,⁵⁷ in order to renew the believers through the luminous font for adoption by his Father.⁵⁸ ¹³⁰He, who by nature is Son, has received us as his brothers by grace.⁵⁹ ¹³¹He removes sin's countless stains from those who are reborn in the (holy) font by the Spirit and frees them from servitude to the evil one. ¹³²For those who were baptized into Christ were clothed with Christ, whether male or female, whether Jew or Gentile,

the Lamb. See also §§148-152, where the subject is somewhat amplified.

⁵⁶ Text has *ἀπὸ* (*jer*, "your" pl.) instead of *ἐμῆ* (*mer*, "our"), a common scribal error.

⁵⁷ Cf. Disc. 19.79.

⁵⁸ On the linkage of divine adoption with baptism, see note to §46.

⁵⁹ Allusion to Matt 12:49.

whether slave or free; for, by the same grace, they are children of God and co-heirs with Christ" (Gal 3:27-28). ¹³³Those who descended into the womb of the spiritual font as a gift from the Most Holy Trinity, with priestly blessing and consent, were enlightened in Christ by the anointing and the Spirit,⁶⁰ according to the Word of the Lord: "Receive the Holy Spirit" (John 20:22) unto adoption by the Father of Christ. ¹³⁴For from him the priests received authority to bind and release (from sin);⁶¹ for they make those who are being baptized renounce Satan and die the death unto sin, so that they no longer live in sin on earth.⁶² ¹³⁵Just as the dead cease from all works, the one who is baptized becomes dead to sin and alive unto righteousness, for he receives the image of Christ by the grace of the Holy Trinity.⁶³ Thereafter, "setting your minds on things above" (Col 3:2), in ac-

⁶⁰ Distinct from post-baptismal Chrismation, associated with the bestowal of the Spirit, the baptismal rite in the early Armenian Church included pre-baptismal anointing, following the East Syrian practice; see *Macarius of Jerusalem: Letter to the Armenians, AD 335*, Abraham Terian, trans., AVANT: Treasures of the Armenian Christian Tradition 4 (Crestwood, NY: St Vladimir's Seminary Press, 2008), pp. 104-105. A likely allusion to this practice, apparently maintaining the distinction between pre- and post-baptismal anointing, may be discerned here; cf. Disc. 5.26; 11.41, both with likely allusion to the pre-baptismal part of the rite.

⁶¹ Allusion to Matt 16:19; 18:18. The author here makes a leap from baptismal anointing to priestly anointing or consecration and the assumed authority it bestows; cf. Disc. 5.45, in context.

⁶² Echoing Rom 6:1-14.

⁶³ Note the twin images of baptism as birth and death, owing to John 3:3-8 and Rom 6:1-7 respectively. While the former was stressed in the East and the latter in the West, the two images are often found side by side in early Christian writings (the distinction in the East-West use of these images is overdrawn in liturgiology). Elsewhere, see Disc. 7.89; 13.31 (death); 6.36; 23.91 (birth).

cordance with the truth of the proclaimed Gospel and with what is pleasing to the immortal King, and with just and true and holy lives, you may reach the mansions of eternal life, which is in Christ Jesus. ¹³⁶For such is the rebirth from the spiritual font, whereby those born into filth may obtain what is free from filth by the grace and loving kindness of the Most Holy Trinity: ¹³⁷"Those who are born neither of blood nor of human will but of God" (John 1:13) for the promised inheritance of Christ. ¹³⁸For thus are born the children of God, in the image of the Son of God. And they testify to the truth in times of trouble and peace, and they remain steadfast in the love of God, with right hearts and right confession. And the children of the life-giving Father become recipients of the ineffable heavenly gifts. ¹³⁹Thereafter they do God's work and fulfill his will, in accordance with the Benefactor's beneficence. And they become partners with the heavenly hosts in the service of humankind, by the grace of the Creator, to those who would inherit eternal salvation, which is in Christ.⁶⁴

¹⁴⁰Just as the Son of God became Son of Man and took our nature and pursued righteousness with all his soul and body,⁶⁵ so ought we to put on what is right and pursue all righteousness in Christ, so that through love we may become children of God and gods.⁶⁶ ¹⁴¹For

⁶⁴ Allusion to Heb 1:14.

⁶⁵ Echoing Phil 2:7.

⁶⁶ For an equally pointed notion of Deification (*Theōsis*), see Disc. 10.48. The scriptural basis of the doctrine is in Ps 82 (81 LXX):6, quoted in John 10:34; cf. 2 Pet 1:4. See also Rom 8:14-17, 29; 1 Cor 15:28; 2 Cor 3:18; Eph 4:24; Phil 3:21; 1 John 3:2. On the emergence of the doctrine in the Early Church, see the various articles in *Theōsis: Deification in Christian Theology*, Stephen Finlan and Vladimir Kharlamov, eds., Princeton Theological Monograph Series (Eugene, OR: Pickwick Publications, 2006).

(as) the Son of God willingly took body and appropriated every aspect of our human nature except sin, ¹⁴²so too should we be able, by the power of God, to pass through everything without sinning, so that we may be able to reach the measure of Christ's perfection and, being truly in the image of God, inherit the Kingdom of Christ. ¹⁴³And it is always necessary to be instructed by the Gospel, which admonishes us with excellent mandates. So that being individually endowed by the grace of the Holy Spirit, we may truly multiply the endowment of truth with a pure heart and right faith in God. ¹⁴⁴And under the supervision of God's providential love let us always be alert and watchful against the fallacies of the accuser,⁶⁷ so that with steadfast hope and virtue, with holy life and pure spirit and body, we may reach the harbor of peace, the eternal life, the unbounded place prepared for the saints by God's ineffable love. ¹⁴⁵And just as this sun gives light to the world and to the creatures therein, those seen in the sea and on land, so may the word and the sanctity of the true faith also illumine the minds of those who long for God. ¹⁴⁶And may the heavenly and earthly beings of sovereign will, both humans and angels, continue to be teachers of the truth by the grace of the Holy Spirit, with sure knowledge and unerring wisdom, abiding by the righteous laws. ¹⁴⁷And thus being led by the Trinity's light, the sure account of that creative essence, may heaven and earth be filled with rays like those of the sun's light, for the life and glory of heavenly and earthly beings. ¹⁴⁸As for Satan, who wanted to become god, he erred in thought in his glory; seeing his brightness, he became proud and fell

⁶⁷ A recurring epithet for Satan (name in Hebrew means "accuser"); see Job 1:9-11; Zech 3:1; 1 Pet 5:8; Rev 12:10.

from his honor.⁶⁸ He began hunting down humans for perdition, enslaving them by vain hopes, by the misleading spirit of alienation — drawing them away from the love of God into diverse passions for wickedness.

¹⁴⁹Should someone ask, “Why did God allow Satan to spread so much misleading lawlessness?” Listen. It is up to the sovereign will of angels and humans, granted by God. It is their prerogative to do what seems best to them; and accordingly, they shall receive their recompense from the Creator of all creatures, as time will tell, either for glory or for torture. ¹⁵⁰Just like death came to reign because of Adam’s transgression,⁶⁹ so Satan lords it over sinners. ¹⁵¹“For men preferred delusion,” (Scripture) says, “for this reason God sends them the effects of delusion... so that they will be condemned... for they delighted in wickedness” (2 Thess 2:11-12). ¹⁵²However, because of his providential love, he did not leave his creatures to

perish: by the coming of his Son, who came into the world to save sinners from servitude to Satan, through faith in the redemption by the glorious Son of God. The tyranny of sin’s reign over humans ended with the appearance of the Savior.

¹⁵³And by grace, by faith in the Holy Trinity, they shall reign, those who have found forgiveness through the (baptismal) font and through the body and blood of Christ, having received the Holy Spirit who spreads gifts in streams to his creatures. ¹⁵⁴Thereafter, those justified by faith shall stand in peace before God,⁷⁰ those who believed in the inheritance attained through Jesus Christ, whose immutable glory is reaffirmed by his willful crucifixion. Through death he abolished death,⁷¹ and through his resurrection he raised us from death because of sin, so that we may stand in the newness of life and abide in the hope of the resurrection;⁷² to the glory of the Most Holy Trinity, now and always and to the ages of ages. Amen.

70 Echoing Rom 3:28; Gal 2:16; 3:11, 24 (cf. Disc. 15.62 and 18.43, where ճշմարտեայր [ēšmartēalk] is used instead of արդարացեայր [ardarac'ealk] as here and in Disc. 23.108; and Disc. 17.27, where the equally specific արդարսր ֆատտով [ardars hawatov] is used).
71 Allusion to Heb 2:14.
72 See Rom 6:3-5; Phil 3:10-11; cf. 2 Tim 1:10.

68 Allusion to Isa 14:12-15; Ezek 28:1-19. Cf. Disc. 6.25-41 and 20.70-84, on Satan’s fall as a result of free-will choice.
69 Allusion to Gen 3:17-19; cf. Rom 5:12-21; 1 Cor 15:21-22.

ԳՐԱԲԱՐԻ ԱՅԼ ԲԱՌԸ (Ե. ԴԱՐ)

Գորգեն Խաչատրեան

Հայերէնի Հազարաւոր բառերից ուսումնասիրութեան առումով առանձնակի հետաքրքրութիւն են ներկայացնում նրանք, որոնք, աչքի ընկնելով Հնութեամբ, Հայոց լեզուի զարգացման բազմազարեայ ճանապարհին ոչ միայն արտայայտութեան եւ բովանդակութեան պլաններում են փոփոխութիւնների ենթարկուել, այլեւ ծառայել են բառապաշարի Հարստացման գործուն միջոց՝ Հանդէս գալով թէ՛ ածանցման եւ թէ՛ բառաբարդման (Համադրական եւ վերլուծական կազմութիւններ) գործընթացներում: Դրանցից է Հայերէնի բնիկ այլ բառը¹, որը գրաւոր աղբիւրներում վկայուում է դեռեւս Ե. դարում՝ գործածուելով թէ՛ Հայ Հեղինակների երկերում, թէ՛ թարգմանական գրականութեան մէջ:

Յետագայ դարերում բառս աւանդուել է ոչ միայն այլ, այլ եւ այդ՝ տարբերակներով², այլեւ ենթարկուել նոր պատ-

մական Հնչիւնափոխութիւնների. միջին Հայերէնում, երբ վերջնականապէս յաղթանակել էր այլ-ը, զուգահեռաբար սկսում են գործածուել նրա ալ, էլ տարբերակները նոյնպէս, բազմաթիւ անգամներ վկայուել է նաեւ դրանց Հետ աղբիւրներ ունեցող³ ալուի/ալլուի/ալլի/էլի մակբայը, որոնք Հիմնականում պահպանում են այլ-ի՝ գրաբարում ունեցած իմաստային եւ գործառական առանձնայատկութիւնները: Ահա օրինակներ Հայրենիքից⁴ Երբ ես ի քէնէ գատիմ՝ Քանց մեռնիմ այլ («ուրիշ») ճար չի լինի (էջ 46): Ոնց որ քունըն գիս տանի՝ Ամանաթ, որ այլ («այլես») չի խօսիս (էջ 46): Դու այլ («ես») իմ կրակն անկնիս, Լուկ հապա ինձի ողորմիս (էջ 61): Չաշխարհս այլ ի յափ առի, Հայեցայ քան զհայելի. Դարձայ՝ ի այլ («դարձեալ») ի վայր դրի, Չի գտայ արտով սիրելի (էջ

«լիմ». որով ունեցանք երկուքի տեղ չորս, զ, շ, ղ, շ: Լ. Աճառեանը կրկնում է Ա. Չալըխեանին. «... ճիւղ ձեռագիրներում, - գրում է նա, - (այլ բառը - Գ. Խ.) գրումս է հասարակապէս այլ, այդ, այդ՝ ձեւերով, որոնց մէջ հնագոյնն է այդ» (Լ. Աճառեան, Աջ. աշխ., էջ 168): Լ. Մուրադեանն այս կապակցութեամբ գտնում է. «Լ-ի եւ ղ-ի գրութեան շփոթը արձանագրում է մեզ հասած առաջին իսկ ձեռագրերում: Գրութեան այնպիսի ձեւեր, ինչպիսիք են՝ թոյղ (թոյլ), գայղ (գայլ), այղ (այլ) ... եւ այլն, արդէն հանդիպում են Լազարեան ճեմարանի 887 թուականի գրչութեամբ հասած Աւետարանում: Գրութեան մէջ նման փոխանցումներ պնտոհետեւ պատահում են նաեւ այլ ձեռագրերում՝ ընդհուպ մինչեւ XII դարի վերջերը: Գրութեան այդ ձեւերը անլի տիպական են յաճախակի են յատկապէս IX-XI դարերի ընթացքում գրումս կամ ընթորիմակումս ձեռագրերում: Աւելի ուշ շրջանում ստեղծումս գրատր աղբիւրներում այդ երեւոյթը ունի եզակի արտայայտութիւն...» (տե՛ս Լ. Գ. Մուրադեան, Հայոց լեզուի պատմական քերականութիւն, Բու. Ի, Երեւան, 1982, էջ 211):
3 Լ. Աճառեան, Աջ. աշխ., էջ 168:
4 Ա. Մնացականեան, Հայրենիք, Երեւան, 1995: