



**Anna
PAKHLIAN**

PhD in Economics, Associate
Professor

In 2006, she graduated with honors from YSIE (now ASUE) and in 2012 she got the degree of PhD in Economics. In 2019, she received the title of associate professor. Anna is a researcher of "Amberd" Research Center, associate professor of ASUE chair of International Economic Relations. She has been trained and lectured at several European universities. She is the author of 47 scientific and 10 popularly available analytical works.



<https://orcid.org/0000-0002-5854-2473>

TURKEY'S UNFAVORABLE REPUTATION ACCORDING TO INTERNATIONAL INDEXES AND RANKINGS

DOI: 10.52174/2579-2989_2021_6_98

Keywords: *global organized crime index, global terrorism index, criminality, trafficking, smuggling, illicit trade*

Actively intervening in the conflicts in many countries under the guise of fighting terrorism, Turkey has positioned itself in the international community as a pioneer in the fight against extremist nationalist and terrorist groups, while there is ample evidence that Turkey works closely with these groups to their full potential, serving its own geopolitical goals. Naturally, cooperation with terrorist groups is accompanied by other manifestations of international organized crime: human trafficking, smuggling across borders, trafficking in illegal weapons and drugs, illicit exploitation of flora and fauna, as well as non-renewable resources, etc. All this is reflected in international indicators and rankings such as the Global Organized Crime Index and the Global Terrorism Index.

Although Turkey has positioned itself as an active player "in global efforts to prevent violent extremism and to counter-terrorism", it is still considered as "a source" and the "main transit point" for foreign fighters.² Moreover, actively involved in several conflicts over the past decade, harnessing the potential of Islamist extremists, Turkey has become a key export hub for terrorism. At the same time, the proceeds of various terrorist transactions, including the proceeds from the illegal sale of oil and gas resources, weapons and drugs, are used to feed and finance terrorism.

¹ United Nations Human Rights Office of the High Commissioner 'UNHROHR', <https://www.ohchr.org/Documents/Issues/RuleOfLaw/PCVE/Turkey.pdf>

² Counter Extremism Project. Turkey: Extremism and Terrorism, p. 2 / <https://www.counterextremism.com/node/13523/printable/pdf>

The world community is aware of a range of facts that show Turkey's cooperation with terrorists, including jihadists from Syria and Libya. Thus, in the war unleashed by Azerbaijan in September 2020, hundreds of fighters from Syrian militias allied with Turkey have joined the fighting between Azerbaijan and Armenia over the disputed enclave of Nagorno-Karabakh.³

The Gray Wolves, a Turkish extremist organization, classified as a “terrorist” group by the recommendation of the European Parliament,⁴ is responsible for the export of terrorism to Syria and the Caucasus. The organization is known as a military arm of the right-wing National Movement Party in Turkey and is participating in its government. The Gray Wolves targets the Kurds, Armenians and other minorities. Responsible for several incidents, which often take on the appearance of punitive expeditions against detractors of the Ankara regime or members of the Armenian community, the members of Gray Wolves are not reluctant “to use violence and disturb public order”.⁵

Actually, with the direct participation of terrorist groups, Turkish criminal deals on the illegal supply of weapons, drugs and oil products are carried out, in which the superpowers - the United States, Great Britain, Germany, etc. - have a serious involvement. Turkey, in fact, has assumed the role of a servant of the “precious” interests of the superpowers, in return for which it “enjoys” the silence of the world community and the apparent indifference to its own criminal aspirations of “spreading terrorism”. It turns out that Turkey has managed to keep dependent on both terrorist groups and the superpowers fed by their oil and gas resources through mutually beneficial deals.

The illicit economy in Turkey includes a

wild range of activities: production, use and trafficking of drugs, smuggling of cigarettes, oil, counterfeit pharmaceuticals, nuclear materials and antiquities, human smuggling and trafficking, kidnapping, money laundering by criminal and terrorist organizations and other forms of illicit activities, which are facilitated by widespread corruption reaching to the top of government.⁶

The Global Organized Crime Index is designed to assess levels of organized crime and resilience to organized criminal activity in all the UN member states – 193 countries. According to the Global Organized Crime Index 2021 Report, nearly 80% of the world's population today lives in countries with high levels of criminality. The Report also highlights how state involvement in criminality is a deeply embedded phenomenon around the world: state officials and client list networks who hold influence over state authorities are now the most dominant brokers of organized crime, and not cartel leaders or mafia bosses, as one might be forgiven for thinking.⁷

The Global Organized Crime Index metrics are based on three constituent parts: the scope, scale and impact of specific criminal markets; the structure and influence of criminal actors; and the extent and effectiveness of countries’ resilience measures – the antibodies that protect against the threat of organized crime. Using a scale of 1 to 10, these three domains assign criminality and resilience scores in each UN member country.

The criminality score and its subcomponents for Turkey are presented in the table 1.

The impact of criminal markets within the Criminality score is evaluated through 10 specific illicit markets, which are: human trafficking, human struggling, arms

³ Abdulrahim R., ‘Turkish-Backed Syrian Fighters Join Armenian-Azeri Conflict’/ The Wall Street Journal, Oct. 14, 2020, <https://www.wsj.com/articles/turkish-backed-syrian-fighters-join-armenian-azeri-conflict-11602625885>

⁴ Europe and the Gray Wolves... A shadow of an escalation between Brussels and Ankara, by The News Glory, 10/06/2021, <https://thenewsglory.com/europe-and-the-gray-wolves-a-shadow-of-an-escalation-between-brussels-and-ankara/>

⁵ Pressfrom, The Turkish nationalist “Gray Wolves”, dissolved but still active in France, 07 February 2021 / <https://pressfrom.info/au/news/world/-342977-the-turkish-nationalist-gray-wolves-dissolved-but-still-active-in-france.html>

⁶ Cengiz, M., Roth, M.P. (2019). The Illicit Economy in Turkey: How Criminals, Terrorists, and the Syrian Conflict Fuel Underground Markets, Lexington Books, 253 p.

⁷ Global Organized Crime Index 2021, Global Initiative against Transnational Organized Crime, p. 4. / <https://ocindex.net/assets/downloads/global-ocindex-report.pdf>

TABLE 1

Organized criminality level in Turkey in 2021⁶

 TURKEY	CRIMINALITY SCORE 6.89 12th of 193 countries 5th of 46 Asian countries 3rd of 14 Western Asian countries	
	Subcomponents	Scores (Rank among 193 countries) Countries with the worst score
	CRIMINAL MARKETS	6.40 (13) Mexico (8.00)
	Human Trafficking	7.0 Libya (9.5)
	Human Smuggling	9.0 Turkey (9.0)
	Arms Trafficking	9.0 Libya (9.5)
	Flora Crimes	4.0 Brazil (8.5) Congo, Dem. Rep. (8.5)
	Fauna Crimes	3.0 China (9.0)
	Non-Renewable Resource Crimes	9.5 Turkey (9.5)
	Heroin Trade	8.0 Myanmar (9.5) Afghanistan (9.5)
	Cocaine Trade	4.0 Colombia (9.5)
	Cannabis Trade	5.0 Lebanon (9.0) Paraguay (9.0)
	Synthetic Drug Trade	5.5 Myanmar (9.5) Syria (9.5)
	CRIMINAL ACTORS	7.38 (12) Congo, Dem. Rep. (9.0)
	Mafia-Style Groups	8.00 Colombia (9.5) Venezuela (9.5) Somalia (9.5) El Salvador (9.5)
	Criminal Networks	7.50 Congo, Dem. Rep. (9.0) Colombia (9.0) Syria (9.0) Nigeria (9.0) Mexico (9.0)
	State-Embedded Actors	9.00 Syria (10.0) Lebanon (9.5) Iran (9.5)
	Foreign Actors	5.00 Congo, Dem. Rep. (9.0) Iraq (9.0)

trafficking, flora crimes, fauna crimes, non-renewable resource crimes, heroin trade, cocaine trade, cannabis trade and synthetic drug trade. According to data in the table 1. Turkey indicates the highest scores in the world in such criminal markets as human struggling and non-renewable resource crimes. Nevertheless, it doesn't mean that the country has a lower role in the other markets of criminal activity.

Due to its pivotal location at the crossroads between Asia, the Middle East and Europe, combined with its long borders, Turkey becomes a key player in the

transnational markets for both human trafficking (7.0) and human smuggling (9.0). Human trafficking in Turkey is characterized predominantly by trafficking for sexual exploitation and forced labour, concentrated mainly in the country's tourist areas, in metropolitan cities (Istanbul) and in cities near the Caucasian and Iranian borders. Forced marriage and forced begging, as well as human trafficking to harvest organs, are the other forms of human trafficking spread in Turkey. According to Global Financial Integrity report on transnational crime, in the

⁶ Global Organized Crime Index 2021, Country Profile / Turkey, https://ocindex.net/assets/downloads/ocindex_profile_turkey.pdf
⁹ Channing May, Transnational Crime and the Developing World // Global Financial Integrity, March 2017, p. 29, <https://gfiintegrity.org/report/transnational-crime-and-the-developing-world/>

Turkish black market donor kidneys are offered at unjustifiably high prices of \$ 100.000 - \$ 140.000, providing extra high profits to intermediaries.⁹ More than 3 million Syrian refugees have crossed the border into Turkey to escape the violence in their country, turning into potential victims of organ trafficking, which is often the only way for them to survive¹⁰ or pay for smuggling.

As for arms trafficking, Turkey plays a role as simultaneously a source, transit and destination country for illegal arms, which are widely used by the Turkish state for external political objectives.

A critical component of Turkey's illicit marketplace is the illicit trading of non-renewable resources (9.5), especially oil smuggling (sourced primarily from Syria, Iraq and Iran) and gold smuggling, which serve as the more profitable sources of income for organized crime groups in Turkey.

Other environmental criminal markets, such as flora and fauna crimes (4.0 and 3.0 respectfully), are less pervasive in Turkey, although they remain important features of the country's illicit economy.

Due to its strategic location between Asia and Europe and along the Balkans Route, as well as its proximity to the heroin and opium-producing areas of Afghanistan and Pakistan, Turkey has taken a central role in the world narcotics trade. Although, the most pervasive drug market in the country is the heroin trade. Moreover, Turkish organized criminal gangs control the wholesale importation of heroin into Europe.¹¹

The other component describing criminality is criminal actors (7.38), which are manifested in form of mafia-style groups, criminal networks, state-embedded actors and foreign actors.

Turkey itself has become known as a mafia state, as the Turkish government often leverages certain criminal markets, such as

the gold and oil trade, human smuggling and arms trafficking, for its own benefit and political purpose. A significant number of mafia-style groups operating in Turkey, as well as state-embedded individuals are thought to be involved in illegally transferring weapons to Salafi-Jihadist groups fighting in Syria and Libya, as well as providing weapons to paramilitary groups in Turkey.

The "resilience" component of the Global Organized crime Index is defined as the ability to withstand and disrupt organized criminal activities as a whole, rather than individual markets, through political, economic, legal and social measures. Resilience refers to countries' measures taken by both the state and non-state actors. The level of resilience against criminality in Turkey is shown in the table 2.

Having a robust anti-organized crime legal framework, including legislation on most forms of organized crime, as well as legislation criminalizing the establishment and membership of an organized criminal organization, Turkey, has a major issue in the lack of application and enforcement of these laws. Turkey appears to have strong bilateral and multilateral cooperation frameworks in place, including having ratified all relevant international treaties and conventions about organized crime, which remain just on paper.

Another indicator characterizing propensity for criminality in certain countries is the Global Terrorism Index, which measures the direct and indirect impact of terrorism, including its effects on lives lost, injuries, property damage and psychological aftereffects. This composite score ranks countries according to the impact of terrorism, from 0 (no impact) to 10 (the highest impact). According to the Global Terrorism Index, Turkey ranks 18th in the world, 1st in Europe and 2nd in the G-20 list.¹² The score of the index for Turkey was 6.11 in 2019, which showed a significant

¹⁰ Capatides Ch., Williams H., "Desperate Syrian refugees are resorting to selling their organs on the black market just to pay rent", CBS News, May 19, 2020 / <https://www.cbsnews.com/news/desperate-syrian-refugees-selling-organs-to-survive/>

¹¹ Global Organized Crime Index 2021, Country Profile / Turkey, https://ocindex.net/assets/downloads/ocindex_profile_turkey.pdf

¹² Trading Economics, Terrorism Index - <https://tradingeconomics.com/country-list/terrorism-index>

TABLE 2

Level of resilience against criminality in Turkey in 2021¹³

 TURKEY	RESILIENCE SCORE 3.54 151 st of 193 countries 37 th of 46 Asian countries 11 th of 14 Western Asian countries	
	Scores	Countries with the worst score
Political Leadership And Governance	3.00	Somalia (1.0) Congo, Dem. Rep. (1.0) Eritrea (1.0)
Government Transparency And Accountability	3.00	Somalia (1.0) South Sudan (1.0) Syria (1.0) Korea, DPR (1.0) Burundi (1.0) Equatorial Guinea (1.0) Eritrea (1.0) Nicaragua (1.0)
International Cooperation	3.50	Venezuela (1.5) Burundi (1.5) Turkmenistan (1.5)
National Policies and Laws	4.50	Lybia (2.0) Somalia (2.0) Syria (2.0) Venezuela (2.0) Korea, DPR (2.0) Yemen (2.0) Suriname (2.0) Tajikistan (2.0)
Judicial System and Detention	2.00	Lybia (1.5) Syria (1.5) Venezuela (1.5) Korea, DPR (1.5) Yemen (1.5)
Law Enforcement	3.00	Lybia (1.5) Somalia (1.5) Venezuela (1.5) Central African Republic (1.5) Korea, DPR (1.5) Burundi (1.0) Congo, Dem. Rep. (1.0)
Territorial Integrity	6.50	Lybia (1.5) Somalia (1.5) South Sudan (1.5) Syria (1.5) Central African Republic (1.5) Mali (1.5)
Anti-Money Laundering	2.00	Lybia (1.0) Korea, DPR (1.0) Suriname (1.0)
Economic Regulatory Capacity	4.00	Lybia (1.0) Somalia (1.0) South Sudan (1.0) Venezuela (1.0) Korea, DPR (1.0) Yemen (1.0) Eritrea (1.0) Chad (1.0)
Victim And Witness Support	4.00	Lybia (1.0) Somalia (1.0) South Sudan (1.0) Venezuela (1.0) Korea, DPR (1.0) Yemen (1.0) Eritrea (1.0) Guinea-Bissau (1.0) Chad (1.0)
Prevention	3.50	Lybia (1.0) Central African Republic (1.0) Korea, DPR (1.0) Chad (1.0)
Non-State Actors	3.50	Syria (1.0)

¹³ Global Organized Crime Index 2021, Country Profile / Turkey, https://ocindex.net/assets/downloads/ocindex_profile_turkey.pdf

decrease since 2016 when the country score was measured at 7.52. According to the index, the top 10 countries in the world are

Afghanistan, Iraq, Nigeria, Syria, Somalia, Yemen, Pakistan, India, Congo and the Philippines.

REFERENCES

1. Abdulrahim R., 'Turkish-Backed Syrian Fighters Join Armenian-Azeri Conflict' / The Wall Street Journal, Oct. 14, 2020, <https://www.wsj.com/articles/turkish-backed-syrian-fighters-join-armenian-azeri-conflict-11602625885>
2. Capatides Ch., Williams H., "Desperate Syrian refugees are resorting to selling their organs on the black market just to pay rent", CBS News, May 19, 2020 / <https://www.cbsnews.com/news/desperate-syrian-refugees-selling-organs-to-survive/>
3. Cengiz, M., Roth, M.P. (2019). The Illicit Economy in Turkey: How Criminals, Terrorists, and the Syrian Conflict Fuel Underground Markets, Lexington Books, 253 p.
4. Channing May, Transnational Crime and the Developing World // Global Financial Integrity, March 2017, p. 29, <https://gfiintegrity.org/report/transnational-crime-and-the-developing-world/>
5. Counter Extremism Project. Turkey: Extremism and Terrorism, p. 2 / <https://www.counterextremism.com/node/13523/printable/pdf>
6. Europe and the Gray Wolves... A shadow of an escalation between Brussels and Ankara, by The News Glory, 10/06/2021, <https://thenewsglory.com/europe-and-the-gray-wolves-a-shadow-of-an-escalation-between-brussels-and-ankara/>
7. Global Organized Crime Index 2021, Country Profile / Turkey, https://ocindex.net/assets/downloads/ocindex_profile_turkey.pdf
8. Global Organized Crime Index 2021, Global Initiative against Transnational Organized Crime / <https://ocindex.net/assets/downloads/global-ocindex-report.pdf>
9. Pressfrom, The Turkish nationalist "Gray Wolves", dissolved but still active in France, 07 February, 2021 / <https://pressfrom.info/au/news/world/-342977-the-turkish-nationalist-gray-wolves-dissolved-but-still-active-in-france.html>
10. Trading Economics, Terrorism Index - <https://tradingeconomics.com/country-list/terrorism-index>
11. United Nations Human Rights Office of the High Commissioner (UNHROHR), <https://www.ohchr.org/Documents/Issues/RuleOfLaw/PCVE/Turkey.pdf>

Աննա ՓԱԽԼՅԱՆ

«Ամբերդ» հեղափոխական կենտրոնի հեղափոխող, ՀՊՏՀ,
միջազգային փնտրեսական հարաբերությունների ամբիոնի դոցենտ,
փնտրեսագիտության թեկնածու

ԻՍԿ ԴՈՒՔ ԳԻՏԵՔ, ՈՐ...

**ԹՈՒՐԻՔԻԱՅԻ ԱՆԲԱՐԵՆՊԱՏ ՀԱՄԲԱՎՆ ԸՍՏ ՄԻՋԱԶԳԱՅԻՆ ՀԱՄԱԹՎԵՐԻ
ՈՒ ՎԱՐԿԱՆԻՇՆԵՐԻ**

Ահաբեկչության դեմ պայքարի քողի տակ ակտիվորեն միջամտելով մի շարք երկրներում ընթացող հակամարտություններին՝ Թուրքիան միջազգային հանրության շրջանում իրեն դիրքավորել է որպես ծայրահեղ ազգայնական և ահաբեկչական խմբերի դեմ պայքարի առաջամարտիկ, մինչդեռ բազմաթիվ փաստեր վկայում են այն մասին, որ երկիրը սերտորեն համագործակցում է այդ խմբերի հետ՝ դրանց ներուժը ծառայեցնելով սեփական աշխարհաքաղաքական նպատակների սպասարկմանը: Բնականաբար, ահաբեկչական խմբավորումների հետ համագործակցությունն ուղեկցվում է միջազգային կազմակերպված հանցավորության մնացած դրսևորումներով՝ մարդկանց թրաֆիքինգ և սահմանների մաքսանենգ հատումներ, ապօրինի զենք-զինամթերքի ու թմրամիջոցների առևտուր, բուսական և կենդանական աշխարհի, ինչպես նաև չվերականգնվող ռեսուրսների ապօրինի շահագործում և այլն: Այդ ամենն իր արտացոլումն է գտել միջազգային համաթվերում և վարկանիշներում, ինչպիսիք են, օրինակ, կազմակերպված հանցավորության և ահաբեկչության համաշխարհային համաթվերը:

Հիմնաբառեր. *կազմակերպված հանցավորության համաշխարհային համաթիվ, համաշխարհային ահաբեկչության համաթիվ, հանցավորություն, թրաֆիքինգ, մաքսանենգություն, ապօրինի առևտուր*

Анна ПАХЛЯН

Исследователь исследовательского центра «Амберд», АГЭУ,
доцент кафедры международных экономических отношений,
кандидат экономических наук

А ВЫ ЗНАЕТЕ, ЧТО...

**НЕБЛАГОПРИЯТНАЯ РЕПУТАЦИЯ ТУРЦИИ СОГЛАСНО МЕЖДУНАРОДНЫМ
ИНДЕКСАМ И РЕЙТИНГАМ**

Активно вмешиваясь в конфликты в ряде стран под предлогом борьбы с терроризмом, Турция позиционирует себя в международном сообществе как первопроходец в борьбе с экстремистскими националистическими и террористическими группировками, в то время как есть множество свидетельств того, что Турция тесно сотрудничает с этими группами, используя их потенциал для обслуживания собственных геополитических целей. Естественно, сотрудничество с террористическими группировками сопровождается другими проявлениями международной организованной преступности: торговлей людьми и их контрабандной перевозкой через границы, незаконным оборотом оружия и наркотиков, незаконной эксплуатацией флоры и фауны, а также невозобновляемых ресурсов и т. д. Все это отражено в соответствующих международных показателях и таких рейтингах, как Глобальный индекс организованной преступности и Глобальный индекс терроризма.

Ключевые слова: *глобальный индекс организованной преступности, глобальный индекс терроризма, преступность, торговля людьми, контрабанда, незаконная торговля*